<u>Appendix 2 List of Representations from the Public Regarding Alternatives to Option D, Specifically to Either Raise Income or Reduce Expenditure together with an Officer Response</u>

As part of the consultation respondents were requested to suggest alternative approaches to Option D, the following represents the list of alternatives provided which respondents felt would either lead to an increase in income generation of reduction of cost.

In some cases the representations have been summarised.

It should be noted in reading all the suggestions below that the report provides a commitment to seek to continue to explore opportunities for innovative approaches to income generation, partnership and service enhancement as part of a longer term programme for the future.

Members do have the opportunity to recommend that Officers consider any of these representations in more detail, however where the Officers' preliminary assessment indicates that any of these options would be unlikely to be achieve the aspirations for the future of the library service, either themselves or as part of a package of options, this is indicated in the 'Officer Response' column to this appendix.

	Representations **Suggesting that savings should come from other areas of the council rather than libraries.**	**Officer Response**	**Action Necessary if this proposal was pursued.**
1.	'The proportion of the Council budget spent on the library service is very small compared to the need for savings elsewhere, and radical cuts to this service can't be justified.'	The council is facing significant financial challenges in the next few years, resulting from reductions in revenue funding from central government. All areas of the council will need to look at making significant reductions in order to meet this challenge. The Library Service is no exception.	
2.	'Rather than impact the library services the council should approach other venues to save money or raise funds where the impact will be less critical or where changes are more easily reversible in the future.'	As above	
3.	Higher council-tax rates (hold referendum if necessary)	If the council wanted to increase council tax by more 2% (15/16 limit), a referendum would be required. Council tax	

		bills would have to be issued with a higher than 2% rate on the 1st April prior to a referendum taking place. There are costs to the council with holding a referendum and it is doubtful that residents would vote to increase their council tax bills in any case. If the increase was rejected, the council would need to issue new bills immediately, offer refunds at the end of the year or allow credits the following year - subject to a right for council taxpayers to request a refund on demand.	
4.	Ensuring landlords pay appropriate taxes (e.g. for HMOs)	The council will take all action to ensure that debts are properly recovered and all those that should make contributions are doing so	
5.	Taxing specific groups (e.g students, high earning individuals, large businesses) in a more proportional manner.	This is an area outside the control of the local authority.	
6.	Cancelling weekly bin collections – collect these every fortnight	The council is exploring all options to address its financial challenges. All areas of the council will need to look at making significant reductions in order to meet this challenge.	
7.	Turning off street lights for some parts of the night	The council is exploring all options to address its financial challenges. All areas of the council will need to look at making significant reductions in order to meet this challenge.	
8.	Selling artwork	The council is exploring all options to address its financial challenges. All areas of the council will need to look at making significant reductions in order to meet this challenge. The Art work is overwhelmingly owned by the Chipperfield bequest, whose assets must be used for the benefit of the gallery and its collection. There is no legal basis on which art works could be used to support the library service.	
9.	Cancelling future developments/maintenance of footpaths/cycle paths	Capital funding used for new developments can only be used for capital purposes e.g. building or investment in equipment.	

		It is ongoing revenue funding that is needed to keep libraries funded into the future.	
		In relation to the maintenance budgets, the council is exploring all options to address its financial challenges.	
10.	Making future roads/pavements more narrow	The council is exploring all options to address its financial challenges. All areas of the council will need to look at making significant reductions in order to meet this challenge.	
11.	Secure Capital budget	Capital funding can only be used for capital purposes e.g. building or investment in equipment. It is ongoing revenue funding that is needed to keep libraries funded into the future.	
12.	Use reserves, borrow funds	The council does use reserves and borrows funds as part of its financial strategy. However, all areas of the council will need to look at making significant reductions in order to meet this challenge. This option does not present a means to delivering services in a sustainable way.	
13.	Insert more speed cameras (to raise revenue)	This is outside the councils control as all the funding for these cameras go straight to central government.	
14.	Reduce council staff, reduce salaries and associated benefits (for senior staff) save money by avoiding "showy public events and pursuit of "wow" factor landmark developments and sculptures. "	The council is exploring all options to address its financial challenges including staffing across the council. All areas of the council will need to look at making significant reductions in order to meet this challenge.	
15.	Investigating opportunities for working with other local authorities in other council services, to save money outside the library services.	The council is exploring all options to address its financial challenges including partnership working with other authorities. This is not a short term solution and in the meantime all areas of the council will need to look at making significant reductions in order to meet this challenge.	
16.	Utilising part of the budget for social care towards the library services, as the latter is said to help maintain the wellbeing of local residents as any other council provided	The social care budget is also under significant pressure within the council and is unlikely to be able to under pin the challenges experienced by the Library Service.	

	service.		
17.	It is argued that savings associated with the closure of each library can be much better made through salary cuts and staff redundancies, especially for senior/management council staff. The savings associated with the closure of each library are £57k on average – that's 6 months' salary for one of the Council's senior executives.' The council is urged to save money through employing competent staff and/or reorganising staff tasks (ie so duplicity of work is avoided) .	The council is exploring all options to address its financial challenges including reducing the staffing structure.	
18.	'Plug the gap for a limited time of 1-2 years until 'normal' council funding returns in the future. The council is urged to keep funding the existing library services for a limited time without any changes until its financial situation improves.	The council is facing significant reductions to funding over the next few years. It is not anticipated that funding will increase to 'normal' levels after this time. Instead the council will need to operate permanently within its reduced budget.	
19.	'The provision of the library services should be independent to the private sector as it is meant to provide education, not make a profit.'	There are no proposals to privatise the library service.	
20.	The council is urged not to open a new art gallery – instead it is suggested that the existing one should be used, to save money.	The New Arts Complex is the next major step in the City's Cultural Quarter, which will bring jobs, investment and visitors to the City. Commitments to the development of this project have been in place for a substantial period of time - prior to financial challenges now facing the Council. The complex will provide new performing arts spaces, and new facilities for the John Hansard Gallery - it is not a replacement for the City Art Gallery	

| 21. | Instead of selling library buildings it is suggested that the council should maintain ownership and make use of these buildings as e.g. day care facilities or resource centres | It is not proposed at this stage to sell library buildings. The proposal is to create the opportunity for community and not for profit organisations to develop community led libraries in the buildings. | |

No	**Representation Directly Relating to Changes in the Library Service**	**Officer Responses**	**Further investigatory work should members wish to explore this option in more detail**
1.	The council is urged to find a middle ground between closing down libraries and allowing volunteers to take over locations.	It is hoped that the development of the community package including resources and equipment to assist community groups and not for profit organisations to develop community led libraries is a move towards a middle ground. In order to make the savings required the council would need to save the cost currently incurred on the staff and buildings.	Discussion with groups regarding their views on their proposals for a solution which still makes the savings but is considered to be a "middle ground solution."
2.	The council should provide administrative expertise, infrastructure and financial support, while the community provides in kind support, help fundraising and source social capital.	In order to make the saving identified it would not be possible to provide administrative and financial support. However, there is a member of staff within the new structure with responsibility for partnership working and providing guidance, support and training to community led libraries.	
3.	Specific services could be contracted while the council continues to manage library buildings.	If the council were to tender the libraries under a contract a management fee would need to be paid to the organisations providing the service. Option D maintains the Council's obligations, and does not exclude further changes to help deliver on the ongoing financial challenges	Feasibility study to identify whether there is an interest in the city council contracting out the library service, if Members wished to pursue this as an alternative to Option D. This would require funding and delay the

			implementation of any revenue savings.
4.	The council is urged to use volunteers for future running of the library service, planning how these services should be delivered, volunteers should be actively recruited (through advertising) and then trained.

Keep a minimal level of paid-staff in each library (to maintain adequate levels of operations, expertise, cooperation with the Council and other libraries) and compliment with volunteers who can be responsible for a variety of aspects- supervising the premises at certain times/days, opening/closing the libraries etc. | As part of the councils Future Focus it is proposed to increase the number of volunteers supporting the library service across the city providing additional services such as homework clubs and computer buddies.

Current agreements with the Unions relating to the role of volunteers in council services would prevent the substitution of staff with volunteers.

Option D seeks to maintain the quality of service currently delivered in six libraries, whilst creating the opportunity for innovation in the other buildings. | To reduce the number of staff in a library and replace with volunteers would need a revised agreement with the Trade Unions which is unlikely to be supported. |
| 5. | Funds raised on site at different libraries can be pulled together to form a budget which could be spent on local libraries in need or based on some priority system. | The library service has a single budget that is allocated to individual libraries. Option D has been developed using a needs assessment methodology top meet priorities. | |
| 6. | Automate processes – check in and check out (across all libraries) | The self service equipment is located in all but 3 libraries, these are Cobbett and Burgess Road Libraries plus Weston.

The self service equipment would cost around £8,000 per library, so to locate in all three remaining libraries would cost around £24,000 together with ongoing servicing and maintenance costs together the need for replacement planning.
It is not anticipated that implementing self-service equipment across all the libraries would secure the saving required. | Members have the opportunity to identify funding for self-service machines for all the libraries but it is not anticipated that this will result in a further saving to the service. |
| 7. | Charge a small annual fee to use library services including borrowing books (concession/free for certain groups.) | Legislation prevents the city council charging for the basic library services such as borrowing books. It would be possible to charge for other activities however whilst this | Where legally possible officers will be investigating all options for |

		might generate a minimal income, it would not secure the saving required even as part of a package of options.	generating income through libraries and implementing where possible.
8.	Charge a small fee for hiring books, DVDs, music etc	Please note the statement above regarding the charge for books. There is already a cost associated with borrowing DVDs. It is not anticipated that this option would secure the saving required even as part of a package of options.	As above.
9.	Charge a small fee for using computers	This would be possible, however it is anticipated that the majority of people that are using the people's network computers are those that may not have access to IT at home. This is not recommended by Officers as this service is heavily used by those applying for benefits and jobs and those least able to pay for the service. It is not anticipated that this option would secure the saving required even as part of a package of options..	It would be possible to research if there are methods of charging for the use of computers, whilst still identifying a mechanism for providing free access to those most in need. There would be a need to identify if any other local authority are adopting this approach and if so how this is being achieved. There would be a need to ensure that the end result would not impact significantly on staff time given the need to maximise the effectiveness of staff.
10.	Charge a small fee for attending events, talks, activities	This would be possible, however it is not anticipated that this option would secure the saving required even as part of a package of options.	Where legally possible officers will be investigating all options for generating income through libraries and implementing where possible.

11.	**Share the premises and /or hire out space/equipment for non-library use as listed below**:		
11a	During operation hours/when the premises are not used by the library	This is a practice which takes place already in some libraries and there is scope to increase this. However it is not anticipated that this option would secure the saving required even as part of a package of options.	As above.
11b	Other public sector services	Officers leading the project has attended forums attended by many public sector agencies including Southampton Connect and the Public Sector Property Board. The current position with the libraries has been discussed and no organisations have come forward to make a financial contribution and share any of the libraries affected by the proposals in this report. All public sector services are experiencing financial challenges at this time. It is not anticipated that this option would secure the saving required even as part of a package of options and therefore it is not recommended by officers as an alternative to Option D.	This avenue has already been explored but discussions will continue to see if opportunities exist in relation to the retained libraries in the future.
11c	CAB, Capita (as an extension of Gateway)	CAB and Capita already have a presence or hire library spaces. There has also been extensive discussions with both organisations about potential opportunities for increasing the partnership working in libraries. Discussions will continue but benefits are likely to be required to meet the ongoing financial challenges.	These discussions will continue.
11d	Other Council Services e.g. Southampton Day Services	All council services are facing financial challenges at this time. The Library Manager has explored partnerships across the council with a view to partnership initiatives or shared spaces. Whilst there is scope for significant partnership working to date this has not identified options that would secure either financial contributions or the saving required.	Discussions will continue in relation to the retained libraries.
11e	Council meetings using on site equipment	All council services are facing financial challenges and	Any opportunities for

		therefore it is not anticipated that this would not secure the savings required.	raising income will continue to be pursued.
11f	NHS and affiliated health services eg mental health, paediatric care, help for people with disability, asthma clinic	All public sector services are experiencing financial challenges at this time. There are forums where health and city council staff come together and the opportunity for partnership working at the libraries particularly affected by the proposals in this report has been explored. However, the health organisations in the city are maximising the efficiency and effectiveness of their core estate and directing their funding at patient care. Opportunities for significant investment in the libraries affected by the proposals in this report are unlikely. However discussions will continue to ensure that all partnership opportunities are explored in relation to any of the retained libraries. It is not anticipated that this option would secure the saving required in the timescale even as part of a package of options.	Discussions will continue in relation to retained libraries.
11g	A health hub	Please see above.	
11h	Charities e.g Age Concern, Private Business eg food and drink venues, café, internet café, arts & crafts shops	There are a number of organisations including charities that already provide services from libraries. It is considered unlikely that charities would have the funding to underpin the savings needed by libraries. Catering is something that the city council is looking to explore and implement where feasible however research from other libraries shows that this would produce a modest income stream and therefore this is not something that will achieve the saving required.	Detailed feasibility study for the implementation of catering across the city libraries, if Members felt this could be pursued as an alternative to Option D.
11i	Use for private functions and community groups: e.g. pop up cinema, parties and religious groups	The Library Service has introduced charges for the hiring of spaces in libraries however it is not anticipated that this would secure the savings required even as part of a package of options.	
11j	Virtual office addresses'- charge for the right to	Any opportunities for raising income will continue to be	

	use library address	pursued explored and potentially pursued , however it is not anticipated that this would secure the savings required even as part of a package of options.	
11k	Add Wi Fi and make locations attractive for working professionals	All the city libraries do have Wi Fi and these spaces are used by people studying, researching and working. There are currently no charges for using the Wi-Fi provision.	No further research required.
11l	'Desk Hire: see model offered by a company called workstation in St Albans'	This is something that has been explored as an opportunity for other council staff. However, given the savings required across the city council this is unlikely to secure significant income.	Research St Albans example.
11m	Parcel Collection Point.	This is something that has been the subject of some examination however this would be as an added service rather than as an alternative to Option D.	
11n	Keynotes marketing research – can one access that from CRL computers'.	This is not recommended as an alternative to Option D.	
11o	Use Business Link to provide advice on fund raising.	Any opportunities for raising income will continue to be pursued.	
11p	Local Business Franchise	It is possible that a community group could secure a local business franchise to take space within one of the five libraries. However, it is anticipated that the income would be insufficient to fund the council's costs of running the libraries. This does not rule it out as an option for the future particularly where there is service enhancement such as a catering franchise.	Research through the Chamber of Commerce if Members wish to pursue this as an alternative option.
11q	Items other than books can be loaned (e.g tools).	This is something that could be explored where there is a demand however any income would be modest and this could not be an alternative to Option D even as a package of options. This does not rule it out as an added service.	
12.	Vending Machines.	Catering is something that the city council is looking to explore and implement where a business case can be made.

The level of catering provision in libraries tends to be relatively limited, and often requires substantial investment, there is an opportunity to work towards a long | This is covered in the catering response above. |

		term return on investment for this type of initiative, but this does not meet the more immediate needs of the Council. Shorter term provision such as vending can assist in raising small scale income, but is not an alternative to option D, but a measure that will help to meet the ongoing financial challenges (where there is a business case for doing so) and improve the customer experience.	
13	A Library Shop.	There is some evidence that where there is sufficient footfall there is an opportunity to introduce retail within libraries. Currently there are items for sale such as reading glasses, this does produce a modest income. The range of retail items will be extended as appropriate opportunities emerge. This is not recommended as an alternative to Option D.	
14.	A food /drink facility and/or room which can be rented out for use by groups etc.	As above	
15.	Fund raising initiatives (e.g. establish a libraries trust, library charity)and sponsorship/grants for libraries (e.g. the airport, Fords, St Marys Stadium, Local universities, 'Saints'.)	The transfer of the library service into a charitable trust is not anticipated to secure the saving required at this time.

Creation of a community driven charitable trust to run an independent library is possible and this may be something that community groups consider.

Many grant making bodies and sponsors prefer to fund charitable trusts rather than local government.

The councils does have significant experience of securing grants and funding for a number of projects. Funding is usually project related and it is considered unlikely that such funding could be used to fund the day to day running costs of a library as they currently stand. | These organisations and others could be contacted to identify whether they would grant fund or sponsor a library. This would involve developing a sponsorship package if Members wished to pursue this as an alternative option. |
| 16. | Have a Poet in residence to attract funding and publicity. | It is not anticipated that this option would secure the saving required even as part of a package of options and therefore it is not recommended by officers as an alternative to Option D. This does not rule it out as an | |

		added service.	
17.	Creative writing workshops (with participation fee) for children and adults.	Any opportunities for raising income will continue to be explored and pursued if feasible. It is not anticipated that this option would secure the saving required even as part of a package of options.	
18	Tuition classes or homework clubs.	Any opportunities for raising income will continue to be explored and pursued if feasible. It is not anticipated that this option would secure the saving required even as part of a package of options.	
19.	Introduce commercial advertising space in/on library buildings and within premises.	Any opportunities for raising income will continue to be explored and pursued if feasible. It is not anticipated that this option would secure the saving required even as part of a package of options. This does not rule it out as an additional income earning option.	Seek specialist advice on the installation of commercial advertising across libraries although this would not be an alternative to Option D.
20.	Expand building (build extra floors, extensions) to increase space for commercial activities.	This is not considered as an alternative to the five libraries identified. Three of the libraries are operated under leases/licences and it would not be possible on these sites to develop additional floors. In the case of Burgess and Cobbett Road Libraries (which are standalone council owned properties), the footprints are considered to be too small to attract development interest above the library.	
21	Use library rooms for parent training sessions, paediatricians to meet with local parents and children, the CCG should be asked if they could use the room.	Any opportunities for raising income will continue to be explored and pursued if feasible. It is not anticipated that this option would secure the saving required even as part of a package of options. This does not rule it out as an additional service or income earning opportunity. However all public sector services are experiencing financial challenges at this time. There are forums where health and city council staff come together and the opportunity for partnership working at the libraries particularly affected by the proposals in this report	

		has been explored. However, the health organisations in the city are maximising the efficiency and effectiveness of their core estate and directing their funding at patient care. Opportunities for significant investment in the libraries affected by the proposals in this report are unlikely. However discussions will continue to ensure that all partnership opportunities are explored in relation to any of the retained libraries.	
22.	Form partnerships with councils/organisations/companies/industries to raise revenue.	Any opportunities for raising income and forming partnerships will continue to be explored and pursued if feasible. It is not anticipated that this option would secure the saving required even as part of a package of options.	This work will continue.
23.	Co locate libraries at schools.	There are considerable issues to overcome in relation to the provision of public libraries on schools sites. If there is an enthusiasm from the school, the right design and the necessary funding it is possible to make these partnerships work. At present there have not been any approaches from Schools suggesting this as an option. However, this is not to say that this opportunity will not exist in the future. The difficulty will be funding this continue service whilst still trying to achieve the full saving available from the affected libraries, unless the library was staffed by volunteers. This is why this is not proposed at this time.	A feasibility study to investigate options for locating libraries in schools around the city if Members wish to pursue this option further.
24.	Re mortgage the buildings.	Any money obtained from potentially mortgaging civic buildings could only be used for capital (building or investment) purposes and therefore could not be used to help balance the council's ongoing revenue budget.	
25.	Accept book donations (eg from universities) and sell second hand books.	Book donations are already welcome at Libraries and second hand books are also for sale, this does raise small amounts of income.	
26.	Introduce donation boxes at libraries aswell as in other locations.	This is certainly an option that could be pursued as an additional source of fundraising.	
27.	Narrowing down the range of services provided by each local library and provide some of these	It is difficult to anticipate how this would reduce costs significantly.	

	at other locations ie schools and surgeries.		
28.	Reduce opening-hours across all libraries – but keep them all council run. Spread the reductions across the entire service rather than close particular libraries.	Whilst it is considered that this could achieve the saving required it is not recommended by officers given the impact that reducing opening hours would have on the busiest libraries in the city. A detailed exercise has been completed which has identified that to achieve the same saving would mean that Millbrook, Weston and Thornhill would be open two afternoons a week, Cobbett Road one day a week, Burgess Road a day and a half a week, Lordshill and Portswood 2 days a week and Shirley, Bitterne and Central Library 3/4 days a week. This means that for several days of the week the busiest libraries in the city would be closed. This is before allowance is made for the loss of income which would reduce opening hours by two to three hours a week more. This equates to around a 16 hour reduction in opening times in the larger libraries.	
29.	Volunteers could assist in operating libraries which are smaller with more limited functions and opening hours – the council is urged to consider downsizing local libraries rather than closing.	The Future Focus does identify the need to encourage more volunteers within libraries but as already mentioned these need to provide additional services to the staff rather than substitute staff. Without reducing the staffing allocation it is not possible to make the saving required. In terms of downsizing, the three smaller libraries are currently only open for 12 hours per week, it is difficult to anticipate any reduction in these hours would still provide a feasible service. Burgess and Cobbett Road could reduce their opening hours further however, this would not produce the saving needed. It is also worth noting that volunteers regularly work along paid staff across the Library Service.	
30.	The Library at North Baddersley, Hampshire is proposed as an example where paid staff are	This Library is operated by volunteers with the support of a member of staff that visits from Hampshire County Council	

	complemented with volunteers who do not have access to personal information databases but help with queries, reservations, signing up new users, troubleshooting the self-service machines and training new staff.	to provide advice and guidance and dealing with issues that they come across in the operation of the voluntary library. The city council is also proposing a community package which will also consist of some staff support, guidance and training.	
31.	Action groups of volunteers can be tasked with helping the council to secure sources of income.	Action groups of volunteers fundraising would be helpful to the service for both libraries that may be run by community groups and indeed the retained libraries. However, it is not considered to be an alternative to the savings that need to be made.	
32.	It is argued that Central Library has 100 volunteers who could potentially take over the running of its services freeing up funds that can be used in other libraries.	The volunteers referred to are used to deliver books to housebound people. Current agreements relating to the role of volunteers in council services would prevent the substitution of staff with volunteers. Therefore Officers are unable to recommend this as an alternative to Option D. Volunteers are an essential part of the whole library service and provide an important role, it is also hoped to increase the number of volunteers to enhance the service further. But these volunteers cannot substitute the staff.	
33.	It is suggested that the council should not consider training volunteers to help manage libraries, but instead should use the funds to have less, but more efficient professional staff.	Unfortunately, less staff would still incur more cost than the council is able to fund. The proposals in the report identify all the staffing hours allocated to the 5 libraries and the mobile need to be taken as savings in order to achieve the target identified.	
34.	Staff should be trained to encourage lending (on a commission basis).	As mentioned earlier it is not possible to charge for book lending.	
35.	Install an officer that will be responsible for fundraising towards the library services instead of installing an officer to manage the CAT process.	There is a greater risk from implementing a fundraising strategy compared to achieving savings from ceasing to provide a service from libraries. This is therefore not recommended by Officers as an alternative to Option D.	
36	Ensure each library is used more intensively (e.g through advertising). Promote/advertise	All opportunities for fundraising and securing revenue will continue to be explored for all the retained libraries	

	the benefits of reading and other services… Make libraries more accessible – leading to higher revenue.	however it is not considered that this approach would raise the target figure.	
37.	The council is urged to consider outsourcing library services (e.g. to GLL).	This is very similar to exploring a trust model. Please see comments in relation to the Suffolk Trust Model.	
38.	The council has the required experience and expertise to run the libraries while delegating other tasks to volunteers/groups	Current agreements relating to the role of volunteers in council services would prevent the substitution of staff with volunteers. Therefore Officers are unable to recommend this as an alternative to Option D. Volunteers are an essential part of the whole library service and provide an important role, it is also hoped to increase the number of volunteers to enhance the service further. But these volunteers cannot substitute the staff.	
39.	The housebound service should be combined with the mobile library.	If the mobile library service was to continue this would be an option to extend the housebound service across the city more widely.	
40.	The council is urged to reconsider each the needs of the areas to consider whether smaller libraries with specific aims would be preferable instead of closure.	In terms of downsizing, the three smaller libraries are currently only open for 12 hours per week, it is difficult to anticipate any reduction in these hours would still provide a feasible service. Burgess and Cobbett Road could reduce their opening hours further however, this would not produce the saving needed.	
41.	Non affected libraries (e.g Bitterne, Lordshill and Shirley) should be transferred to community/partnership management either in addition to or instead of the affected libraries.	When the Needs Assessment Exercise was carried out these were identified as higher priority libraries using the criteria that was developed for this exercise. This would therefore place some of the busiest and most visited libraries in the hands of volunteers which would be a more significant challenge than the libraries currently identified.	
42.	The council should open new libraries.	The new Woolston Library will open in 2016 as it was provided as part of a planning deal with a developer. This would be the only way currently to fund new libraries or as part of a partnership opportunity. However, the biggest challenge is not the funding of new libraries but the running costs associated with operating them.	
43.	Re-house some of the affected libraries at	The only way to achieve this would be if there were no	

	Eastpoint in Thornhill and/or the leisure centre in Weston.	rental or staffing costs involved otherwise the saving would not be made. Discussions to date with Active Nation who manage the Leisure Centre at Weston has not identified any space in the building which could be used at no cost. The main issue is not the location but the staffing costs of provision.	
44.	The council is urged to only keep one of (either) Bitterne or Portswood Libraries, and use the money saved by the closure of one to fund the other.	The Needs Assessment Exercise identified the 5 affected libraries and the Mobile Library to be the lowest priority libraries in meeting the criteria identified.	
45.	Integrate with Hampshire/ Portsmouth.	Discussions have been taking place with Hampshire and Portsmouth for some years in relation to the potential for partnership working. However these are long term options which would not achieve savings in the short term. There are significant challenges to overcome in bringing the organisations together. These options are therefore not proposed at this time as an alternative to Option D at this time. Discussions will continue.	These discussions will continue.
46.	Sharing back-office functions and the use of a library purchasing consortium.	This has been discussed as part of the above item.	
47.	Working with different organisations/companies/sectors eg local businesses, national companies, job centre etc.	The subject of Libraries has been discussed in Southampton at many Forums including Southampton Connect and also the Public Sector Property Board. These are attended by a wide range of organisations. It is proposed to continue these discussions however it has not yet identified any potential sources of funding.	
48	Working with schools/universities to share library facilities e.g. offering books at other facilities, have universities fund and use public library space for their students, running libraries as outreach programmes or for student work placements, selling library locations to universities, having links with play groups and nurseries.	See comments elsewhere on this list in relation to schools and university partnerships.	

49	Set up a task force led by local government in partnership with other bodies involved in the library sector to work with local authorities to help them improve, revitalise and if necessary change the local library service, while encouraging, appropriate to each library, increased community involvement.	The subject of Libraries has been discussed in Southampton at many Forums including Southampton Connect and also the Public Sector Property Board. These are attended by a wide range of organisations. It is not proposed at this time to set up a cross organisational task force dedicated to libraries however, this could be raised at various forums to establish if there is an appetite for this across the relevant organisations.	
50	Follow the Suffolk model.	The Suffolk Trust which has charitable status has 44 libraries that serves 730,000 people. The budget for the service is around £7-8m. This is a much larger operation to Southampton and with a significantly higher budget and more buildings. The majority of savings have been achieved through through a reduction in rates as a result of the charitable status in addition to taking responsibility for their own IT, HR and Finance support Implementation costs were reported to be several hundred thousand pounds. Officers consider that the formation of a trust for libraries in Southampton would not raise the savings figure required in the timescale. It is therefore not recommended as an alternative to Option D at this time.	There is already a significant amount of knowledge within the authority relating to the formation of trusts. However there would still be a need to employ consultants to put together a feasibility study if Members wish to pursue this option further.
51	Follow the Lowford Community Library Model.	Lowford Community centre was built by Eastleigh Borough Council and the centre opened in Easter 2014. It has several large community rooms, one has a sprung floor used for dance. A community café, library and a doctor surgery.

Eastleigh Borough Council paid for the fit out of the library and Hampshire County Council provides the book stock, a half day paid member of library to visit and support the volunteers. The library provides a reservation service and open returns and is considered part of the Hampshire library network. It costs Hampshire County Council around £5,500 per annum to deliver the library service at Lowford. Netley. Hampshire County Council provides a self-serve | |

		kiosk that provides issues and returns of loans. There is one public IT terminal for go-online access and free public wifi. The library provides a range of free family and adult activities such as baby rhyme time, knit and natter, etc. The community appointed a volunteer co-ordinator who recruits and trains the volunteers and rotas. The community association pays for the building running costs and any repairs and maintenance. Hampshire County Council does give the fines and charges back to the community in an annual payment in arrears to help cover running costs. Hampshire Cc currently has 5 community libraries set up in a similar way as Lowford. The others are: • Milford-on-sea • Kingsclere • North Baddersley, near Romsey • The Carroll Centre, Stanmore, Winchester	
52	Follow the Library model used in Sweden.	It is not obvious what model is being referred to here. The municipal libraries in Sweden are in the main funded by the local authorities.	
53.	Follow the USA library model.	It is not obvious what model is being referred to here, there are many different types of libraries in America. Many libraries receive Federal Funding but in recent years there has been a reduction in funding causing reductions in service and in some cases closures. There are new styles of libraries being provided such as the one in Texas which is book free, users hire tablets and borrow ebooks.	
54.	Libraries in Community centres or used for more community –based activities and learning initiatives.	The proposals within the cabinet report include the opportunity for community groups to have collections of library books deposited in their buildings for use by local	

		people and users.	
55.	Use funding from social inclusion projects to keep libraries open.	Funding will continue to be sourced for projects, however it is unlikely that these type of funding initiatives will be able to fund the ongoing running costs of a library such as rent, rates, utilities, library staff etc.	
56.	Support Weston, Thornhill and Millbrook Libraries via the HRA (within estate areas).	The Housing Revenue Account is a ring fenced account, this means the Council has no general discretion to transfer sums into or out of it. The items that can be charged to it are prescribed by statute and mainly centre on repairs and maintenance, and the management of property. One of the main purposes for the ring-fence is to ensure that rents paid by local authority tenants accurately and realistically reflect the cost of providing the housing service, and should not be used to cover the cost of other Council services. So whilst this funding has been used for particular projects in line with the above, it would not be possible to use the funding for the core ongoing revenue cost of library services.	
57.	A council representative at a public meeting confirmed there is a budget available for community groups – this should be used to keep the libraries running.	Grants are available for community groups within the city , details can be found at this link http://www.southampton.gov.uk/people-places/grants-funding/default.aspx	
58.	Each of affected libraries should become dedicated to specific aspects of library services (eg.IT or books) hence become more attractive for users.	It is not anticipated that this would secure the saving required.	
59.	More initiatives performed by libraries staff should take place in schools as this would encourage children to read and would be easier to implement compared to having volunteers running a library.	It is not anticipated that this would make a saving as the staffing costs would still be incurred.	
60.	Schools should provide their own libraries (and not rely on public libraries for their students) and the schools service could be reduced to allocate funds elsewhere.	The schools pay a subscription for the Schools Library Service which (following the changes proposed within the staffing structure in the Library Service) will cover the costs of this service.	

61.	School librarians should replace the schools library service to free up resources. This is said to also save funds as the large collection of curriculum books will no longer need to be supported.	Please see the comments above.	
62	Local libraries should focus on reference books while much of the lending could be done from a desk for issuing books in large chain stores such as Sainsbury's or John Lewis.	Alternative locations for a "click and collect" style service will be explored in line with the Future Focus. Issues of reference material are declining compared to fiction.	
63	The council is urged to consider locating libraries near key shopping areas as these are said to attract large crowds.	Those libraries located close to shopping areas do tend to be some of the busiest libraries in the city such as Shirley Library.	
64	The bus service could be used to transport books between library services.	It is difficult to anticipate how this could be a practical solution and achieve a significant saving.	
65	It is suggested that the remaining libraries should be made bigger and more appealing and have funds invested in them so they can cope with the likely higher demand.	This is noted, however at present there no funding is identified to achieve this.	
66	Utilise money from other areas of library budget to keep local libraries'.	This would be achievable and would result in reduced opening hours and level of service in the busiest libraries across the city. This is therefore not recommended by Officers.	
67	The council should proceed with options A, B or C.	Noted.	
68	The council is urged to introduce a new service which could deliver books to people's homes.	This will be explored as part of proposals contained within the Future Focus of the Library Service.	
69	A free bus to and from libraries for people from affected areas that are socially deprived.	This would incur significant cost.	
70	Libraries should close down as the rise in access to digital content is gradually replacing the need to provide local/physical services.	Noted.	
71	Collaborate with local universities.	Following communications with managers of the Universities, they do understand the financial position that	

		the council faces. Restrictions on funding means that university funds must generally be spent on educational purposes for students. However, both of the city universities have offered to encourage student volunteers in community led initiatives if these were taken forward.	
72	Speculate to accumulate and exploit the libraries. That way you will have them making money, thus reducing overheads.	All routes to generate funding will be explored with the retained libraries.	
73	'It appears that vast amounts of money are allocated to the use of a very small number of people with severe learning disabilities – this seems disproportional and the money should be partly allocated towards meeting the needs of the wider public.'	The amounts are quite small and supplied by the Skills Funding Agency and administered for the council by the Skills and Community Learning service. As the funding is external it cannot be used for any other purpose, including a saving.	
74	Books for minority populations/non English should not be funded further.	These books ensure that libraries are accessible to all cultures across the city.	
	Specific to Central Library		
75.	Central library should have its opening hours/days extended as the site is particularly accessible.	This is noted. This would currently incur additional staff cost and therefore would not be possible. If there are options which do not incur additional cost then these can be explored.	
76.	Make the library more efficient so that it can cater for a wider area than it currently does potentially reducing the need for smaller libraries elsewhere.	This is noted.	
77.	The council is asked to specifically invest in this librarys IT	This is noted. This is certainly within line with the Future Focus but is dependent on funding becoming available in the future.	
	Specific to Burgess Road Library		
78.	Further integrate Southampton University in developing and supporting this library through eg funding, partnership, study programme and work placement etc. Further taxing the	Whilst Southampton University would not be able to fund the provision of a library for the community, it is likely that student may be interested in providing volunteer support to a community initiative.	Discussions at the highest level with those in both universities to confirm whether there is an

	university is proposed as one of the mechanism to allow this to happen.	Halls of Residence for students are exempt from council tax provided the accommodation is owned or managed by a prescribed educational establishment or by a body established for charitable purposes only. Halls of residence are not subject to business rates. A tax levy on the University for building halls of residence would be counter productive given the aim of ensuring that there are less students in houses of multiple occupation. The Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL) allows Local Planning Authorities to raise funds from new developments including halls of residence. It is levied on extensions and buildings. The charges are set by the local council, based on the size and type of the new development. However, the money raised from the CIL can only be used to fund a variety of infrastructure as set out in section 216 (2) of the Planning Act 2008. This includes strategic transport schemes, flood defences and open spaces. The money cannot be used to help balance the council's ongoing revenue budget.	appetite to assist with the libraries affected by the proposals contained in this report if Members wish to pursue this approach.
	Specific to Cobbett Road Library		
79.	'The Friends of Cobbett Library 'group undertake much voluntary work and wish to help keep the library operating in the future. A combination of revenue-raising initiatives and over-arching council support and direction is proposed as the way forward, while a strong opposition to the CAT approach is raised.'	Volunteers are very much appreciated to be an essential part of the whole library service and provide an important role, it is also hoped to increase the number of volunteers to enhance the service further in the future. But these volunteers cannot substitute the staff. Any revenue raising initiatives are welcome, however it is not anticipated that this would be a viable alternative to Option D. Therefore Officers are unable to recommend this as an alternative to Option D. A support package is being proposed as detailed in the report.	
80.	The council is urged to include core groups that use this library on a regular basis as part	The council would be keen to see the core groups that use the library as part of any future community proposal that is	

	of any future solution.	submitted to the council.	
81.	The council is urged to further develop the site as it serves the needs of local schools.	The council has put together a community library package to assist community and not for profit groups to continue to provide a library service from the building.	
82.	The council is urged to preserve the building even if it no longer hosts the local library.	There are no proposals to demolish the building.	
83.	The library can become a joint enterprise venture.	Option D would not rule out the opportunity for a joint enterprise venture.	
84.	The library could become a heritage centre run in association with the local heritage society, local museum and local community groups.	Option D as a proposal would not rule out any community group developing the library building as a heritage centre on the basis that there would still be a library provision within the building aswell.	
	Specific to Millbrook Library		
85.	The council is urged to provide internet access on this site	The community library package on offer as a result of the consultation would allow the peoples network computers to still stay within the affected libraries if community groups are prepared to take on these buildings to provide some type of library provision.	
86.	The council is to provide a pickup service for library books.	The "click and collect" style of library provision is certainly something that will be explored as this increases the convenience for those who would like to reserve and renew books on line but not need to visit a library in order to collect books.	
87.	The council is urged to re-locate this library into a more central and easily accessible location with Millbrook.	The most significant costs associated with this library is the staffing costs and to relocate the library would not achieve the savings required if the staffing commitment was still required. If a community organisation is suggesting that they would be keen to operate the library from an alternative building this could certainly be explored further.	
	Specific to Weston Library		
88.	This location can be shared with the local Post office who may be looking for an alternative premises after the recent demolition of the shopping site.	Option D would not rule out any partnership with public or private sector organisations. However the risk of finding a partner that could fund the staffing requirement for Weston and the fact that there would be insufficient space in	

		Weston Library to offer shop facilities which are integral to Post Office franchises means that Officers would not recommend this as an alternative to Option D.	
89.	'The library building in the new Weston Shopping parade should be converted into a Community Lifelong Learning centre. This centre should be tailored to attract young local people, provide free internet and computer access and aim to become a bright and vibrant social focus for a regenerated Weston, emphasising the rich cultural and historical background of the district.'	It is possible that this could be achieved by a community organisation taking on the lease for the space, but staffing and building costs would remain a challenge if the city council was to continue to manage the service. This would then not produce the saving required.	
	Specific to Portswood Library		
90.	'The Council should consider a merger of Portswood and Burgess Road libraries. 'The new premises could be located within the university area and in collaboration with that institute.'	Portswood is a busy and well located library on the high street in the district centre. To relocate the library out of this location would disadvantage a large number of users. There are no obvious sites available and space is of a premium on the university campus to provide university accommodation.	
91.	Some comments suggested that this library should close before any other library if any libraries are to close at all.	Using the Needs Assessment Exercise, this library was identified as a higher priority than those 5 that the city council proposes to cease to provide a service from.	
	Specific to Woolston Library		
92.	The council is urged to save money by using the existing library building/facilities rather than re developing the site.	The library is now almost completed and this was provided as part of a housing development. The existing Woolston library is outdated and in need of improvement, the children's section which is upstairs is inaccessible to those relying on wheelchairs and buggies. The new library building be fully accessible, much more flexible in layout and will be shared with housing staff.	
93.	The council is urged to have parking available at the new site.	There is parking nearby.	
	Specific to the Mobile Library		

94.	'The mobile library service should be further developed and made bigger and more efficient, so it can adequately cover the areas that won't have a local library anymore. This should offer a way for the council to service the areas and populations that will no longer enjoy having a local library.'	In order to achieve the saving required the mobile library ceasing to provide a service needs to be as part of Option D. If it was not part of the option it would be necessary to incorporate Lordshill or Woolston which are both used by a larger number of people.	
95.	'Consider a service that allows for 'pre – booking' and streamlined pick-up of ordered items.'	There are certainly opportunities to improve the services to allow for a click and collect style service from a variety of local venues. However this is seen as a service enhancement rather than an alternative to Option D.	
96.	It is suggested that a partnership between this service and care/residential homes might keep it running ie through book deliveries and collections.	It is accepted that this would potentially be a source of income towards the cost of the mobile library however it is not anticipated that sufficient funding would be raised to keep the service going.	Contact all the residential care homes, nurseries and sheltered homes in the city to see if they would be prepared for the Mobile Library if Members wish to pursue this option.
97.	It is suggested that the mobile library could deliver services to schools, the homebound service and community projects, possibly with an alternative smaller vehicle.	There is a separate book bus which delivers books to schools at this time. Opportunities for further extending the use of this vehicle will be explored. The costs associated with this vehicle are met by the Schools Library Service which is predominantly funded by the school subscriptions.	
98.	It is suggested that the Mobile Library is the most appropriate choice out of all affected libraries to be managed by community groups and volunteers.	It is not proposed to hand over the Mobile Library to a community group or volunteers. It is an extremely difficult vehicle to drive, and there are also significant costs associated with the ongoing financing and running costs. Both the risk and costs associated with any collision are significant.	
99.	It is suggested by some that the mobile service can be replaced through ebook/streaming content, with guidance and support from dedicated staff to those who are less IT literate.	This supports the councils approach. Although it is recognised that there will be an impact from ceasing to provide the Mobile Library Service and this is identified in the Equality and Safety Impact Assessment.	